

South Hayward BART project

My interest in this project is to encourage development of alternative transportation systems based on market economics, consumer choice, pragmatic gradualism, and sustainable development. I've already proposed a detailed, comprehensive approach to the previous plan. So far, these ideas have gone nowhere.

In the case of Eden Housing, it is up against regulatory barriers I don't understand in detail at the state and possibly federal level. I don't know what regulatory reforms should be proposed to stop over-charging low-income families and seniors for parking they don't want and allowing them or the non-profit housing developer to gain income from market-based parking fees.

In the case of Nelson Nygaard (NN)'s analysis of access, the good job they did on pedestrian analysis and support for parking benefit districts was undercut by one of the worse analyses I have ever seen of an integrated, self-balancing approach to access based on unbundling, shared parking, willingness to pay (wtp), new high-tech easy-pay systems, low-cost, short-distance shuttles, RFP-based operation similar to Union City, and management by a single access agency. NN said they could not do "micro-analysis," but I did it and it's not that hard. I have written an extensive critique of their work, but have stopped part way though because no one seems to be interested, and it takes some sustained attention to the details to understand how unfounded their conclusions were.

So I make these comments, despite being pessimistic they will do any good, because it is intellectually interesting and I am a glutton for punishment.

Council may decide that the reduced plan

- is acceptable,
- is a minor modification to the original plan because it is consistent with eventually achieving the original plan,
- provides affordable housing,
- has to be conditioned on revisions to the HCD grant, to be negotiated if possible, and
- allows the rental housing to be sold as condominiums when the market allows, as has occurred in previous projects.

Comments:

1. Based on ratios from the approved plan, parking seems likely to increase by 224 percent over current conditions, typical of "transit-oriented" development.
2. It seems, based on NN reports and comments so far, that all, or almost all, parking will be bundled.
3. Not building the parking structure is only helpful if the delay allows more sanity and rationality in transportation planning, getting past a verbal commitment to reducing climate change, auto dependency, and congestion while acting to increase them.
4. Reference to "a JPA and a Parking Benefit District" is too vague to be meaningful, assuming benefits that are unlikely to accrue from the weak proposals made so far.
5. We have no estimate yet of project residents use of BART and reduced BART parking need.
6. BART seems likely to impose parking charges on South Hayward without a plan in place for

using the funds for a wtp/RFP/short shuttle self-balancing etc. system that would self-finance increasing and sustainable access to BART.

7. The City should discuss with HCD how Prop 1c funds could be used to increase access to BART more cost-effectively and at less cost than a parking structure.
8. Unfortunately, there are no expensive consultants with the competency to advise you on how to do it, only a local prophet who does it for free.

South Hayward BART, Reduced Plan, East of Dixon

BART property, all spaces	2008	Approved Project		Reduced Plan	
		Housing units	Parking	Housing units	Parking
Current BART station east lot parking	173				
Perry and Key		341	417	195	238
		from west of Dixon		east of Dixon	
Eden Housing, seniors		81	204	64	150
Eden Housing, families		125	incl. above 87		incl. above
Totals	173	547	621	346	388
Parking ratios			1.14		1.12

percent increase in parking, 2008 to reduced plan

224%

Parking for Perry and Key is estimated from the approved project as reported at NN Appendix A July 2010.

Parking for Eden Housing east of Dixon is based on Eden west of Dixon.

There are no details yet on bundled vs. shared parking.

March 7, 2011

Sherman Lewis, President

Hayward Area Planning Association

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]